UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
10/591,340	08/31/2006	Kai Rossen	7601/88254	9531
	7590 10/08/200 OF MICHAEL A. SAN	EXAMINER		
15400 CALHO		LOEWE, SUN JAE Y		
SUITE 125 ROCKVILLE, I	MD 20855	ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER	
			1626	
		MAIL DATE	DELIVERY MODE	
		10/08/2008	PAPER	

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

The time period for reply, if any, is set in the attached communication.

		Applicat	tion No.	Applicant(s)				
			340	ROSSEN ET AL.				
Office Action Summary		Examine	er	Art Unit				
		SUN JAI	E Y. LOEWE	1626				
The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address Period for Reply								
A SHO WHICH - Extensi after SI - If NO p - Failure Any rep	RTENED STATUTORY PERIOD F IEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE N ons of time may be available under the provisions X (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this come eriod for reply is specified above, the maximum s to reply within the set or extended period for reply bly received by the Office later than three months patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).	MAILING DATE OF T s of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no e munication. tatutory period will apply and o will, by statute, cause the ap	THIS COMMUNICATIOn Event, however, may a reply be to will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from Expirication to become ABANDONICATION TO THE COMMUNICATION THE COMMUNICATION THE COMMUNICATION THE COMMUNICATION	N. mely filed n the mailing date of this co ED (35 U.S.C. § 133).				
Status								
2a)⊠ T 3)□ S	Responsive to communication(s) file this action is FINAL . Since this application is in condition losed in accordance with the pract	2b)☐ This action is for allowance excep	ot for formal matters, pr		e merits is			
Dispositio	n of Claims							
5)□ C 6)☑ C 7)□ C 8)□ C	Claim(s) <u>5-24</u> is/are pending in the algae of the above claim(s) is/acclaim(s) is/acclaim(s) is/are allowed. Claim(s) <u>5-24</u> is/are rejected. Claim(s) is/are objected to. Claim(s) are subject to restrict of the specification is objected to by the specification is objected to be specification.	re withdrawn from c						
10) TI	the specification is objected to by the drawing(s) filed on is/are applicant may not request that any objected to be the properties of the properties of the properties of the control of the cont	: a) ☐ accepted or bection to the drawing(s) g the correction is requ	be held in abeyance. Se ired if the drawing(s) is ob	e 37 CFR 1.85(a). Djected to. See 37 CF	, ,			
Priority un	der 35 U.S.C. § 119							
 12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f). a) All b) Some * c) None of: 1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received. 2. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No. 3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)). * See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received. 								
2) Notice 3) Informa	of References Cited (PTO-892) of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (I ation Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08) No(s)/Mail Date	PTO-948)	4) Interview Summary Paper No(s)/Mail D 5) Notice of Informal 6) Other:)ate				

Application/Control Number: 10/591,340 Page 2

Art Unit: 1626

DETAILED ACTION

1. Claims 5-24 are pending in the instant application.

Response to Amendment

- The claim amendments filed on July 21, 2008 have been fully considered. The 35 USC
 112 2nd paragraph rejection has been obviated and is thus hereby <u>withdrawn</u>.
- 3. The remarks filed on July 21, 2008 have been fully considered, however, they are not found to be persuasive in overcoming the previously made 35 USC 103 rejection. This ground of rejection is <u>maintained</u> and made FINAL.

Claim Objections

4. Claims 5-24 remain objected to for containing non-elected subject matter (see office action dated April 21, 2008.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

- 5. Below are responses to Applicant's remarks:
 - a) "The presently claimed process is carried out in a one phase solvent system and relies on rapid precipitation to protect the ketoproline products made. As discussed on page 4 of the application, lines 8-15, the process requires that precipitations occur rapidly after reaction, preferably immediately. This is why the present claims require that the actoproline product be induced to crystallize at the same time that exidizing agent is being added to the system.

Overall, Applicants submit that a main element required by the pending claims, stabilization of ketoproline products by indusing precipitation at the same time that oxidizing agent is added, is not suggested by any of the references cited and, even if the references are combined, this element is totally lacking.

Pursuant MPEP 2144.04.IV. the noted limitation (ie. order of addition of ingredient) is not deemed to impart patentability to the claimed process.

Application/Control Number: 10/591,340 Page 3

Art Unit: 1626

b) "Although Riley uses a one phase system, ketoprolines are not among the oxidation products considered and it is not clear that stability problems of the same degree exist for the compounds studied. Moreover, the products in Riley were analyzed directly in solution and not precipitated or otherwise purified (see footnote on page 1531).

Pursuant MPEP 2143.E, a person of ordinary skill has good reason to pursue "the known options within his or her technical grasp." It is maintained that the combined disclosure of the cited references suggests to one of ordinary skill to make the modification necessary to practice the instant invention with reasonable expectation of success.

c) "Although the Examiner alleges that Narukawa teaches that ketoprolines are not very soluble in water, Applicants have been unable to find such a teaching in the reference. Even if present, it is not clear how this would serve as a motivation to actively induce precipitation while adding oxidizing agent to protect ketoprolines from unwanted reactions.

Applicant is respectfully referred to pg. 549 of the reference, and the guidelines of MPEP 2144.01, excerpts below:

2144.01 Implicit Disclosure

"[I]n considering the disclosure of a reference, it is proper to take into account not only specific teachings of the reference but also the inferences which one skilled in the art would reasonably be expected to draw therefrom."

For the reasons provided above, Applicant's remarks are not found to be persuasive. Therefore, the 35 USC 103 rejection is still deemed proper and hereby made FINAL. Claims 5-24 remain rejected.

Conclusion

6. THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL. Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

Application/Control Number: 10/591,340 Page 4

Art Unit: 1626

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire THREE MONTHS from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within TWO MONTHS of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not mailed until after the end of the THREE-MONTH shortened statutory period, then the shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than SIX MONTHS from the mailing date of this final action.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to SUN JAE Y. LOEWE whose telephone number is (571)272-9074. The examiner can normally be reached on M-F 7:30-5:00 Est.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see http://pair-direct.uspto.gov. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free). If you would like assistance from a USPTO Customer Service Representative or access to the automated information system, call 800-786-9199 (IN USA OR CANADA) or 571-272-1000.

/Sun Jae Y. Loewe, Ph.D./ 9-22-2008

/Kamal A Saeed, Ph.D./ Primary Examiner, Art Unit 1626